

SAR Middle School Brochure Judging Process

2014-15

1. The Objective of the Middle School Brochure Judging Process is to identify and select the State's 1st, 2nd & 3rd place winners of Brochure entrants submitted by the State's SAR Chapters.
2. The State Society's Brochure Chairman is responsible for managing the State's Brochure Judging Process. Judging is recommended to take place during the Society's Spring Meeting, thereby allowing time to submit the State Winner to the National Brochure Contest (beginning in 2014) at the National Congress which occurs in July.
3. Tasks within the Brochure Judging Process:
 - 3.1. Secure all the State Society's Chapter Brochure entrants
 - 3.1.1. in 2012-13 they were all* mailed to the Chairman a month before the Spring Meeting
 - 3.1.2. in 2013-14 to test National Procedures, Chapters could either mailing the actual Brochure or email a quality DPF copy, with the option of bringing the actual brochure to the State Meeting. (One chapter opted to do that.)
 - 3.1.3. in 2014-15 All entries are to be mailed to the Chairman a month before the Spring Meeting (Chapters are encouraged to make a PDF copy for their records.)
 - 3.2. Prepare the Brochures to be Judged:
 - 3.2.1. by Covering the Identification Information on the back panel of the Brochure to conceal its identity
 - 3.2.2. by Marking each one with a unique **Brochure ID** that does not reveal the submitting Chapter
 - 3.3. Identify and select seven (7) State Society Brochure Judges: Responsible men who will be attending the State Society's Spring Meeting – and whose Chapter did not enter a Brochure
 - 3.3.1. In 2014-15: the notion a judge will judge only one of the three categories continued
 - 3.3.2. In 2014-15: the notion of judging pairs continued – two judges / category
 - 3.3.3. in 2014-15: six (6) compatriots to be Category Judges are to be identified
 - 3.3.4. in 2014-15: Identifying the judging pair to judge the **Content Category** is special *
 - 3.3.5. in 2014-15: the seventh judge to be identified to be the Tally Judge
 - 3.3.6. in 2014-15: Prepare forms for the Judges (4A, 4B, 4C)
 - 3.3.7. in 2014-15 Judging Categories will be pre-assigned to specific judging pairs
 - 3.3.8. in 2014-15: PDF facsimiles of the Brochure Entries will be sent to the Judges
 - 3.3.9. in 2014-15: a log of e-mails correspondence with the Judges is maintained
 - 3.4. * Identifying the judging pair to judge the **Content Category**:
 - 3.4.1. Beginning in 2014-15 judging the '**Content**' requires a knowledge of the Themes. The Content 'Theme' can be one of these five (5) "**Foundational Documents of the United States**". These documents include: 1.Articles of Confederation; 2.Declaration of Independence; 3.Constitution; 4.Federalist Papers; and 5.the Bill of Rights.
 - 3.4.2. The persons selected to be the **Content Category Judges** should be comfortable with judging these documents and/or willing to do research while judging for Content.
 - 3.5. Secure meeting space from the Conference Chairman. Allow for sufficient time. Recommend 2 hour – inform Judges of meeting room and time
 - 3.6. Prepare presentation and instructions for the Judges
 - 3.7. The Chairman will direct and oversee the process.
4. Orientation for the Judges:
 - 4.1. Orientation of Judges – Before Judging:
 - 4.1.1. In 2014-15 the six (6) Category Judges to receive emails with resource material
 - 4.1.2. In 2014-15 emails and phone numbers of all judges to be collected and shared
 - 4.1.3. In 2014-15 Category Judging pairs to be encourage to communicate while scoring
 - 4.1.4. In 2015-15 Category Judges to be contacted by Brochure Contest Chairman

SAR Middle School Brochure Judging Process

2014-15

- 4.2. Orientation of Judges – At the Judging Session during the CASSAR Spring Meeting:
 - 4.2.1. Present an overview of the Judging process
 - 4.2.2. Present Hardcopy Resource Material - Allow for time to be read
 - 4.2.3. Discuss (again – before final judging) the three (3) evaluation categories
 - 4.2.3.1. **Content:** i.e.: Adheres to guidelines, Contains ideal mix of historical fact and interpretation, Well organized and logical; Easy to follow, Pictures add to understanding
 - 4.2.3.2. **Creativity:** i.e.: Adheres to guidelines, Prose includes metaphors, similes, and other appropriate tools and demonstrates creativity, wit, and insight into the topic, Pictures depict the topic creatively and imaginatively, Brochure contains additional creative touches that add to the aesthetic appeal
 - 4.2.3.3. **Correctness:** i.e.: Adheres to guidelines, Contains no spelling or grammatical errors, Paragraphing and sentence structure is error free, No erasures or white out evident.
 - 4.2.4. Forms: (Discuss only Form 3 and Form 4)
 - 4.2.4.1. **Brochure Guide Scoring Form 1:** This form is meant for the use of the State Brochure Chairman. The 1st Tab is meant to be used through the School Year to gather information from the Chapters. The 2nd Tab is meant to assist the Chairman in compiling the results of the State Judges to indentify the State Winner and Runner-up.
 - 4.2.4.2. **Brochure Guide Tally Sheet Form 2:** This form is meant as a template for Chapters to use in selecting their Chapter winners.
 - 4.2.4.3. **Brochure Guide Scoring Form 3:** This form contains the elements of the Rubric with a column for each of the three (3) evaluation categories: Content, Creativity and Correctness. This form was be used in the State Level Judging in the inaugural year. Chapters, in selecting their Chapter Winner and entry into the State Level Competition, may choose a less rigorous process.
 - 4.2.4.4. **Brochure Guide Scoring Form 4A, 4B, 4C:** These three forms contain the elements of the Rubric for one of the three (3) evaluation categories: 4A. Content, 4B Creativity and 4C Correctness. This form will be used in the State Level Judging. Chapters, in selecting their Chapter Winner and entry into the State Level Competition, may choose a less rigorous process.
 - 4.2.5. Supplemental (Resource) Information:
 - 4.2.5.1. **Brochure Guide Evaluation Guidelines:** A (9 page) description of how to evaluate and judge the three (3) evaluation categories: Content, Creativity and Correctness.
 - 4.2.5.2. In 2014-15 Category Judges to be provided in email and again in hard copy at the judging session: Orientation: How the Judging Works, Rules-at-a-Glance, Explanation of Brochure Panels, their particular scoring worksheet (**Form 4A, 4B, 4C**)
 - 4.2.6. The Chairman will direct and oversee the process.
- 4.3. Judging
 - 4.3.1. The Category Judges each to have a facsimile of the Chapter Brochure Entries
 - 4.3.2. The Chairman will have one extra set taken from the Display
 - 4.3.3. The Chairman will show the Judge the original Chapter Brochure Entries
 - 4.3.4. The Chairman will give each Judge a Ballot.
 - 4.3.5. The Chairman will assure that each judge has the time to evaluate each Brochure.
 - 4.3.6. Judges are invited to discuss the entries as they decide their final score.
 - 4.3.7. Judges are instructed to record their final score in the **Form 4** worksheet Ballot.
 - 4.3.8. If a judge has a question, he will address the Chairman. All judges will hear the question and the Chairman's response. The Chairman has the absolute authority to make rules for the judging.
- 4.4. Final Scoring
 - 4.4.1. When all Judges have stated they have judged and scored all the Brochures given to them and recorded their scores on the **Form 4** worksheets, final scoring can begin.
 - 4.4.2. The Chairman will collect the Form 4s from the Category Judges and review for compliance before providing them to the Tally Judge.

SAR Middle School Brochure Judging Process

2014-15

- 4.4.3. The Chairman will manage this process until all judges have recorded their scores for all the Brochures being judged.
 - 4.4.4. The Chairman then gives the completed Ballots to the Tally Judge.
 - 4.4.5. The Tally Judge (aka Chief Scorer) will then compile the combined Final Scoring of the six Category judges and present his results to the Chairman.
 - 4.4.6. Judges can submit a score to one decimal point, e.g. '8.5'
 - 4.4.7. The Tally Judge will compute the Average Score of each of the three judging pairs and then sum the three Average Scores for a final score for each entry/
 - 4.4.8. If there is a tie for the 1st, 2nd, or the 3rd place, the Chairman will use the six Category judges to break the tie, by whatever rule the Chairman decides.
5. Award Process
- 5.1. The Chairman will reveal the 1st, 2nd, & 3rd Place Winners in whatever manner has been deemed appropriate for the State Meeting.
 - 5.2. Any Chapter Entry not earning 1st, 2nd, or 3rd Place will be awarded Honorable Mention.
6. Lesson Learned.
- 6.1. Immediately follow the Judging Process of the Chapter Brochure Entries, a session on the Lessons Learned will take place.
 - 6.2. The Chairman will lead the Judges through Lessons Learned discovery process seeking:
 - 6.2.1. What went well – We need to keep doing this:
 - 6.2.2. Where could we make improvements:
 - 6.2.3. Other Comments:
 - 6.3. Subject to the review, but not limited to:
 - 6.3.1. Judge selection / notification process
 - 6.3.2. Resources provided judges – examine each specific resource aid
 - 6.3.3. Judges Orientation
 - 6.3.4. Judging Process

<p>These guidelines have been written based upon the use and experience of the Pilot State Society, the California Society of the SAR (CASSAR), but have been purposely written to (hopefully) be applicable to any State Society. ... These guidelines should be modified to fit the particular State Society's program.</p>
